



DOUGLAS A. DUCEY
- GOVERNOR -

VICTORIA WHITMORE
- EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -

ARIZONA STATE VETERINARY MEDICAL EXAMINING BOARD
9535 E. DOUBLETREE RANCH RD., STE. 100 ♡ SCOTTSDALE, ARIZONA 85258
PHONE: (602) 364-1-PET ♡ FAX: (602) 364-1039
VETBOARD.AZ.GOV

MINUTES

December 14, 2016

Telephonic Board Meeting

Board Room, at 8:30 a.m.

9535 E. Doubletree Ranch Rd., Board room
Scottsdale, Arizona 85258

Members Present Telephonically: Mr. Jim Loughhead, Dr. Les Hatfield, Ms. Julie Young (left at 9:45am), Ms. Jessica Amend, Dr. Christina Bertch-Mumaw, Dr. J. Greg Byrne, Dr. Sarah Heinrich, Dr. Darren Wright and Ms. Nikki Frost, CVT.

Staff and Legal Counsel Present: Ms. Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director; Ms. Sunita Krishna, Assistant Attorney General (A.A.G.); and Ms. Tracy Riendeau, CVT, Senior Medical Investigator.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Roll call: Dr. Bertch-Mumaw at 8:30 a.m.

II. INFORMAL INTERVIEWS AND BOARD DELIBERATION

1.16-88: In Re: Gurit Sandhu, DVM. Continuance of Informal Interview of November 17, 2016, for the purpose of receiving additional information and reviewing and possible action to approve proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and adopting an Order.

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Hatfield and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law as written. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, abstain; Dr. Wright, abstain; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 7 ayes, 2 abstentions.

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Hatfield and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to issue Dr. Sandhu an Order to include a period of **Probation for 1-year** to obtain **six (6) hours of continuing education (CE)**, in addition to the statutory requirements for licensure. The six (6) hours should be in the area of the following:

- 4 hours in radiology; and
- 2 hours in communication.

The Order shall also include a **civil penalty of \$200** to be paid on or before the end of the Probationary period. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, abstain; Dr. Wright, abstain; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 7 ayes, 2 abstentions.

2. 16-91: In Re: Amy Jakobe, DVM. Continuance of Informal Interview of November 17, 2016, for the purpose of receiving additional information and reviewing and possible action to approve proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and adopting an Order.

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law as written. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, abstain; Dr. Wright, abstain; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 7 ayes, 2 abstentions.

After further discussion, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to issue Dr. Jakobe an Order to include a period of **Probation for 1-year** to obtain **ten (10) hours of continuing education (CE)**, in addition to the statutory requirements for licensure. The ten (10) hours should be in the area of the following:

- 5 hours in geriatric cats and anesthetic risks vs benefits; and
- 5 hours in interpreting laboratory results in cats.

The Order shall also include a **civil penalty of \$200** to be paid on or before the end of the Probationary period. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, abstain; Dr. Wright, abstain; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 7 ayes, 2 abstentions.

III. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF PREVIOUS ACTIONS

1. 15-85: In Re: L. Clayton Wengert, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education submitted in compliance with Board Order and may return license to Active status.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve Dr. Wengert's continuing education submitted in compliance with his Board Order and return his license to Active status. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

2. 13-32: In Re: Judith Stolz, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action to return license to Active status.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to return Dr. Stolz's license to Active status. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

3. 15-77 and 15-103: In Re: Refaat Ishak, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education completed in compliance with Board Order, results from National Board of Veterinary Medical Examiners Species Specific Exam, and license status.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to pend this matter to a future Board meeting to give Board staff time to go through the 100 hours of CE Dr. Ishak submitted in compliance with his Board Order. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

4. 14-75 and 15-46: In Re: Gary Yocham, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on notification from licensee and compliance with Board Orders.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to combine cases 14-75 and 15-46 and offer Dr. Yocham a Consent Agreement to voluntarily surrender his license due to Dr. Yocham advising the Board he was retiring and not wanting to comply with terms of his previously issued Board Orders. If the Consent Agreement is not signed within 30 days, the matter will be scheduled for a Formal Hearing. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

5. 16-46, 16-54, and 16-89: In Re: Walter Kurth, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action to set time period to pay civil penalty per Board Order to be issued.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Hatfield and seconded by Ms. Amend to give Dr. Kurth 60 days to pay the civil penalties included in his Board Order. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, abstained; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, abstained. Motion passed 7 ayes, 2 abstentions.

IV. REPORTS, CORRESPONDENCE, REFERRALS AND OTHER BUSINESS

1. Board may review, discuss, and take action on email from Dr. Phelps.

No action.

2. Board may review, discuss, and take action on technician application.

a. Amanda Holmes

After discussion and consideration, the Board directed staff to request Ms. Holmes attend the January Board meeting and submit a more detailed description of the courses she took.

3. Board may review, discuss and take action on complaint received regarding a veterinarian not licensed in Arizona.

No action.

4. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Veterinary application and request for a Temporary Permit.

a. Anna L. Dafarra

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Hatfield and Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to allow Ms. Dafarra to sit for the State exam and approve her request for Temporary Permit. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

5. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Veterinary license pending receipt of issuance Fee and/or proof of graduation.

a. Elizabeth Allegretto

b. Cameron Folkers

c. Sara Ford

d. Kanwarjot Sandhu

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve licensure for the above applicants pending receipt of issuance fee and/or proof of graduation. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

6. Board may review, discuss, and take action on denial of certification for veterinary technician applicants who failed the VTNE and/or State exam. List available upon request.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Ms. Amend to deny certification for applicants that failed the VTNE and/or the State exam and authorize Ms. Whitmore to represent the Board if a settlement conference is requested with her authority limited to denial of certification. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

7. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Veterinary Technician Certification pending receipt of issuance fee and/or proof of graduation.

a. Leigh Basham

b. Rebecca Counter

c. Kayla King

d. Natalie Meier

e. Diana Pacheco

f. Alexis Pinkston

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve certification for the above applicants pending receipt of issuance fee and/or proof of graduation. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

8. Board may review, discuss, and take action on request for Temporary Permit pending receipt of affidavits and proof of graduation.

a. Elizabeth Dooley (R)

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve the request for Temporary Permit pending receipt of affidavits and proof of graduation. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

9. Board may review, discuss, and take action on possible proposed legislation regarding oversight of veterinarians that are currently exempted from the Veterinary Practice Act per A.R.S. §32-2211(2).

Dr. Wright and Ms. Young briefed the Board on their meeting with Senator Kavanagh and other stakeholders. Dr. Nancy Bradley was present and made statements. No action taken.

10. Executive Director Report

a. License/Certificate Renewals update;

Ms. Whitmore updated the Board on the online renewal system progress. The system went live on December 5, 2016 with minor issues that were quickly addressed.

b. Joint Committee on Capital Review meeting and Agency relocation update;

Ms. Whitmore reported that this Joint Committee is meeting later today and will discuss ADOA's proposal for moving multiple agencies into the 1740 W. Adams building. Ms. Whitmore has submitted more information upon ADOA's request along with other agencies, but has not been contacted about our agency's space needs or scheduled move.

c. 2018 (sic) Board meeting schedule and locations.

Ms. Whitmore announced that the proposed schedule for 2017 Board meetings had been distributed but is subject to change due to ADOA's proposed move of the agency.

11. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education audits of license and certificate renewal applications.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Mr. Loughead and seconded by Dr. Wright to direct Board staff to perform continuing education audits on 2.5% of the renewals received. If 20% of the 2.5% have issues and are not in compliance, the audit should be increased to 4.5% of the renewals. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, aye; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

V. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES

November 17, 2016 Regular Session

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Ms. Amend to approve the regular session minutes as drafted. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, abstain; Dr. Wright, abstain; Ms. Young, absent; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 6 ayes, 1 absent (Ms. Young), 2 abstentions (Dr. Heinrich and Dr. Wright).

VI. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Approval to take State Veterinary Exam

1. Acierno, Mark (E)
2. Barras, Paul (E)
3. Dooley, Elizabeth (R)
4. Giffords, Hugh (R)
5. Kashak, John (E)
6. Lanagan, Jenna (R)
7. Oquist, Jessica (R)
8. Carter, Todd (S)
9. Eubank, James (E)
10. Opfenring Amavisca, Danielle (R)

Approval to take the State Veterinary Exam granted.

B. Approval of Premise Licenses

1. **R2717: HealingWise Holistic Veterinary Care, LLC at Four Legged Friends Animal Hospital.** New Premise. Jacqueline Allgire, DVM.
2. **R2718: Bone Crusher, Inc. DBA Dr. Kelly's Mobile Surgical Unit.** New Premise. Kelly Patriquin, DVM.
3. **R2719: Jeffrey Arthur, DVM, PLLC.** New Premise. Jeffrey Arthur, DVM.
4. **R2720: The Animal Neurology and Imaging Center of Arizona.** New Premise. Allison Haley, DVM.
5. **R2721: The Animal Neurology and Imaging Center of Arizona.** New Premise. Allison Haley, DVM.
6. **R2723: Shot Spot Vaccinations at Carl's Ace Hardware.** New Premise. Raymond Gniadek, DVM
7. **R2725: All Equine Veterinary, LLC.** New Premise. Jeff Alldridge, DVM.
8. **R2726: Peaceful Passing Hospice and In-Home Euthanasia.** New Premise. Gina Lee Finney, DVM.
9. **R2727: Eyeshine Veterinary.** New Premise. Zoe Reed, DVM.

**B (2), (3), (6), (7), (8), and (9) Removed from Consent Agenda.
Approval of Premise Licenses granted.**

C. Approval to take Certified Veterinary Technician Exams

1. Curley, Jillian
2. Mayve, Jetaime

Approval to take Certified Veterinary Technician Exam granted.

D. Approval of Request for Reinstatement of Veterinary License

1. Churgin, Sarah

Approval for Request for Reinstatement of Veterinary License granted.

E. Approval of Temporary Permit(s)

1. Oquist, Jessica

Approval of Temporary Permit granted.

F. Approval of Faculty Member License

1. Hofmeister, Erik
2. Patterson, Coretta

Approval of Faculty Member License granted

G. Approval of Veterinary License

1. Bondy, Peter (E)
2. Gamble Christopher (E)
3. Goldensen, Fred (E)

Approval of Veterinary License granted.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, absent; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 absent (Ms. Young).

Items Removed From Consent Agenda

B (6) R2723: Shot Spot Vaccinations at Carl's Ace Hardware. New Premise. Raymond Gniadek, DVM

B (8) R2726: Peaceful Passing Hospice and In-Home Euthanasia. New Premise. Gina Lee Finney, DVM.

B (9) R2727: Eyeshine Veterinary. New Premise. Zoe Reed, DVM.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve the above pending inspection and compliance. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, absent; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 absent (Ms. Young).

B (2) R2718: Bone Crusher, Inc. DBA Dr. Kelly's Mobile Surgical Unit. New Premise. Kelly Patriquin, DVM.

B (3) R2719: Jeffrey Arthur, DVM, PLLC. New Premise. Jeffrey Arthur, DVM.

B (7) R2725: All Equine Veterinary, LLC. New Premise. Jeff Alldridge, DVM.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Dr. Hatfield to approve the above pending compliance. Roll call: Dr. Hatfield, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Amend, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughhead, aye; Dr. Heinrich, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Ms. Young, absent; and Dr. Byrne, aye. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 absent (Ms. Young).

VII. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

No current events.

VIII. CALL TO PUBLIC

No member of the public wished to speak.

IX. ESTABLISHMENT OF FUTURE MEETING DATE

The next regular meeting will be held on **Wednesday, January 18, 2017**, beginning at 8:30 a.m. at 9535 E. Doubletree Ranch Road, Board Room, Scottsdale, Arizona 85258.

X. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 9:55a.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director